August 28, 2015

1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA AT BECKLEY

DAVID M. DAUGHERTY,

Plaintiff,

v.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 5:14-24506

EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC and OCWEN LOAN SERVICING, LLC,

Defendants.

30(b)(6)DEPOSITION UPON ORAL EXAMINATION OF SANDRA LYEW TAKEN ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

Virginia Beach, Virginia

August 28, 2015

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

		2
1	Appearances:	
2		
3	HAMILTON, BURGESS, YOUNG & POLLARD, PLLC	
4	By: JED R. NOLAN, ESQUIRE	
5	STEVEN R. BROADWATER, JR., ESQUIRE	
6	5493 Maple Lane	
7	Fayetteville, WV 25840	
8	(304)574-2727	
9	jnolan@hamiltonburgess.com	
10	sbroadwater@hamiltonburgess.com	
11	Counsel for the Plaintiff	
12		
13	TROUTMAN SANDERS, LLP	
14	By: JASON E. MANNING, ESQUIRE	
15	222 Central Park Avenue, Suite 2000	
16	Virginia Beach, VA 23462	
17	(757)687-7564	
18	jason.manning@troutmansanders.com	
19	Counsel for the Defendant	
20	OCWEN Loan Servicing, LLC	
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

				3
1		INDEX		
2				
3	WITNESS	EXAMINATION BY	PAGE	
4	Sandra Lyew	Mr. Nolan	5	
5		Mr. Manning	132	
6		Mr. Nolan	163	
7				
8		EXHIBITS		
9	NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE	
10	Exhibit 1	Third Notice of Deposition	7	
11	Exhibit 2	Litton Notice of Default letter		
12		DD/OLS 000493-494	37	
13	Exhibit 3	"Draft" document,		
14		DD/OLS 000594-601	38	
15	Exhibit 4	Letter dated March 18, 2013,		
16		DD/OS 000225-2226	39	
17	Exhibit 5	OCWEN Detail Transaction		
18		History, DD/OLS 001635-1746	41	
19	Exhibit 6	Letter dated March 20, 2013,		
20		DD/OLS 000183	42	
21	Exhibit 7	ACDV 3/19/2013	44	
22	Exhibit 8	ACDV 5/31/2013	63	
23	Exhibit 9	Equifax document, DD/OLS 000320	73	
24	Exhibit 10	ACDV response 11/13/2014,		
25		DD/OLS 001333-1334	76	

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

			4
1		EXHIBITS (CONTINUED)	
2	NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	Exhibit 11	ACDV 7/3/2013	80
4	Exhibit 12	ACDV 10/1/2013	82
5	Exhibit 13	ACDV 11/14/2013	86
6	Exhibit 14	ACDV 1/10/2014	89
7	Exhibit 15	Letter and attached documents	
8		from Mr. Daugherty, 3/19/14,	
9		DD/OLS 000570-577	93
10	Exhibit 16	Letter dated March 17, 2014,	***
11		DD/OLS 000566-568	102
12	Exhibit 17	ACDV response 4/24/2014	103
13	Exhibit 18	ACDV response 5/5/2014	111
14	Exhibit 19	ACDV response 6/16/2014	115
15	Exhibit 20	Letter dated April 19, 2014,	
16		DD/OLS 000223-224	117
17	Exhibit 21	ACDV response 6/20/2014	119
18	Exhibit 22	Universal Data Form,	
19		DD/OLS 000310	125
20	Exhibit 23	ACDV response 8/8/2014	129
21	Exhibit 24	ACDV response 9/19/2014	130
22	Exhibit 25	Letter dated March 14, 2013,	
23		DD/OLS 000576-577	130
24	Exhibit 26	Credit Reporting Histories,	
25		DD/OLS 000602-645	132

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

5 30(b)(6) deposition upon oral 2 examination of SANDRA LYEW, taken on behalf of the 3 Plaintiff, before Penny C. Wile, RPR, RMR, CRR, a Notary Public for the Commonwealth of Virginia at 5 large, taken pursuant to notice, commencing at 9:20 6 a.m. on August 28, 2015, at the law offices of Troutman Sanders, LLP, 222 Central Park Avenue, Suite 8 2000, Virginia Beach, Virginia; and this in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. 10 11 SANDRA LYEW was sworn and deposed on 12 behalf of the Plaintiff as follows: 13 EXAMINATION 14 BY MR. NOLAN: 15 My name is Jed Nolan, and I represent 16 David Daugherty who filed a claim against OCWEN Loan 17 Servicing in this matter. 18 Can you state your name for the record? 19 Sandra Lyew, L-Y-E-W. A. 20 And it's pronounced Lyew? 0. 21 A. Yes. 22 Hopefully I don't butcher that up. 23 apologize if I do. 24 We've asked to take OCWEN's deposition 25 And they've designated you as their corporate

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- 1 representative.
- A. Yes.
- Q. So when I say you, I mean actually
- 4 OCWEN. I don't mean you, Ms. Lyew.
- If you need a break at any time, we'll
- 6 take breaks.
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. We're not trying to do a real marathon
- 9 or anything else. We're just trying to get these
- 10 questions out.
- MR. MANNING: And just in terms of
- breaks, I ordered the food to come between 12:00 and
- 1:00. We can take as long or as short as you guys
- want, depending on how your pace is. Sandra has a
- 15 flight she has to be on that boards at 5:20, so she
- has a car coming at 4:00. If that means you're going
- to be real tight on time, we'll take little to no
- lunch, because we know that you said you had a lot to
- 19 get through, but we just kind of wanted to defer to
- you on the lunch timing issue.
- MR. NOLAN: And we'll see. I might be
- able to breeze through it quicker than I thought. If
- we get bogged down, we'll just take a look at it
- 24 then.

25

BY MR. NOLAN: If I ask a question, you don't know what Q. 3 I'm talking about, please ask me to rephrase it. Make me do my job and ask clear questions, okay? A. Of course. 6 MR. NOLAN: The first thing I'd like to 7 do is mark this as Exhibit 1. 8 (Exhibit No. 1 was marked for 9 identification.) 10 BY MR. NOLAN: 11 I've handed you -- this is our Third Q. 12 Notice of Deposition that we filed in this matter. 13 Have you had a chance to review this before coming in 14 today? 15 A. Yes, I have. 16 Okay. I'd like to begin by talking 17 broadly about OCWEN's disputes in their 18 reinvestigation process. 19 How many credit disputes does OCWEN 20 receive annually? 21 That I don't know. A. 22 And I'm just looking for a ballpark 23 figure. More than 100. 25 More than 100? Q.

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

8 A. Yes. 0. More than 150? A. That's possible. I don't know. More than 200? 0. A. I don't know. Q. So OCWEN, from my understanding, is a mortgage loan servicer; is that correct? Yes. A. Do they have any other creditors for any 10 other types of loans besides mortgages? 11 Other creditors? A. 12 Do they service any types of debt other 13 than mortgage loans? 14 They do, as far as I know, residential, 15 mostly residential. I believe there is probably a --16 they do have a commercial division. 17 And so how many loans would OCWEN 18 service at any given time, just a rough estimate? 19 Hundreds of thousands. 20 So out of the hundreds of thousands of 21 loans they have that they're servicing, you estimate 22 that at least 100 disputes come in every year? 23 I can vouch for -- well, I can't vouch A. for that, but I'm going to assume that. I don't want 24 25 to assume. This is why it is a hypothetical.

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- Q. Sure. I'm just trying to get a ballpark
- figure to see how many disputes would come in on an
- 3 annual basis.
- A. We have different departments that
- 5 handle different functions when it comes to disputes
- or any type of -- any type of disputes, whether it's
- 7 credit or the actual accounts. I don't work in those
- 8 departments, so this is why I can't --
- Q. Give an actual firm number? Sure.
- And so if I were to ask the amount of
- 11 time that OCWEN allocates to investigating disputes,
- would you be able to provide a guesstimate on that?
- A. An actual time that they're supposed to
- 14 respond to a dispute?
- Q. Okay. We'll start with that. Yes.
- A. They respond to a dispute within
- 17 30 days.
- Q. Does it typically take 30 days to
- 19 respond to a dispute?
- A. Well, the guidelines is supposed to be
- 30 days -- up to 30 days to respond to a dispute.
- Q. And do you have any -- does OCWEN have a
- 23 typical response time? Is it typically 30 days or do
- 24 they usually get it done quicker than that?
- A. It can be done in less time, depending

August 28, 2015

10

- on the dispute.
- Q. Now, does OCWEN investigate disputes
- inhouse or do they outsource that job function?
- A. No. They do it inhouse.
- Q. So those are OCWEN employees that are
- 6 investigating disputes?
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. How are these employees compensated?
- A. Compensated? I want to assume that
- there is an hourly pay.
- 11 Q. Is there a range of salaries or an
- hourly rate paid to these reinvestigation employees?
- 13 A. I don't know.
- Q. Is compensation strictly hourly or is it
- 15 tied to -- are there any incentives for these
- 16 employees?
- 17 A. I don't know.
- Q. And so it's my understanding there are
- 19 two ways OCWEN can receive a dispute regarding their
- 20 credit: They can get a dispute directly from a
- 21 borrower or a dispute can come from a credit
- 22 reporting agency; is that correct?
- A. That is correct.
- Q. Are there any other ways a dispute can
- 25 come to OCWEN regarding a debtor's account?

August 28, 2015

11

- A. To my knowledge, it's the borrower's
- dispute in writing or it goes -- it's from the credit
- 3 reporting agency.
- Q. Is there any difference in the way that
- 5 OCWEN treats a dispute directly from a borrower
- 6 versus a dispute received from a credit reporting
- 7 agency?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. What if a dispute was to come in from a
- 10 third-party?
- 11 A. They would have to be authorized.
- Let me make that clear. Authorized by
- 13 the borrower in order to speak on their behalf on the
- 14 account.
- Q. So an attorney, in order to file a
- dispute, would have to be authorized by the borrower
- before OCWEN would process that dispute?
- A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And the same for a government agency?
- 20 A. That is correct.
- Q. So when OCWEN receives a dispute either
- from a borrower or a credit reporting agency, what's
- 23 the first step?
- A. The first step is, of course, you
- 25 receive the response. The response is noted in the

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

12

- 1 account.
- Q. I'm sorry. Can you define response for
- 3 me?
- 4 A. Okay. The correspondence --
- Q. Correspondence? Okay.
- A. -- is received, and it's noted in the
- 7 account, in the system. And an acknowledgment letter
- is sent acknowledging receipt of the correspondence.
- 9 And then the investigation and/or research is
- 10 conducted at that point. And then, once that is
- done, then the response gets sent to the borrower.
- 12 Q. So the correspondence is received and
- 13 noted in the account?
- A. Correct.
- Q. At that point the reinvestigation
- 16 occurs?
- A. That is correct.
- 18 Q. Now, what type of reinvestigation is
- 19 done?
- A. It depends on the dispute that comes in.
- 21 So that, based on the dispute, there is not only the
- 22 system that is -- that gets verified, there is --
- we -- I should say we, meaning OCWEN, the credit
- reporting department, has authority by going into and
- 25 reviewing the borrower's documentation, business

- 1 records, that is kept in the ordinary course of
- 2 business.
- Q. You mentioned the credit reporting
- 4 department?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. So once this initial dispute or the
- 7 correspondence response comes in, it gets noted, does
- 8 it get shipped to this credit reporting department?
- A. Again, it depends on the dispute. So it
- goes to a research department. We have a research
- department. And based on the dispute, if the dispute
- is dealing on credit reporting or an account claiming
- that is not theirs, then it would go into the -- it
- would go to the credit reporting department.
- Q. So the research department kind of
- funnels it out? They get it and look at it and see
- where it needs to go from there?
- A. Correct. Or they respond to it.
- Q. What types of disputes would the
- 20 research department respond to directly without
- shipping it on to another department?
- A. Servicing. Servicing research of a
- 23 dispute.
- Q. And what type of employees are employed
- in the research department?

August 28, 2015

14

- A. What type of employees? They're
- 2 employees.
- Q. What kind of educational backgrounds or
- 4 qualifications are required to work in the research
- 5 department?
- A. I don't know. Everything is based on
- 7 experience.
- Q. What type of experience would they look
- 9 for?
- A. Research, mortgage background.
- 11 Q. So someone in the research department
- analyzes the dispute, and then, at this point, if
- they deem that it's regarding the credit reporting it
- 14 gets shipped along to the credit reporting
- 15 department?
- 16 A. That is correct.
- Q. And where is the credit reporting
- 18 department based out of mainly?
- A. That's a -- well, we have Waterloo,
- 20 Iowa. We have West Palm Beach, Florida.
- Q. That's where we tried to do this
- deposition, but we couldn't get it worked out. It
- would have been a lot nicer down there; what do you
- 24 think?
- A. I can only name the offices that we're

August 28, 2015

15

- located in at this point.
- o. Sure.
- A. There is, of course, India. I mean --
- 4 it depends. It's spread out.
- Now, what qualifications are sought for
- 6 employees in these departments?
- 7 A. I don't know. I mean -- I guessed for
- 8 the research department, so I'm not going to
- 9 second-guess it again.
- Q. Are these typically entry level type
- 11 positions? You said that some experience in mortgage
- background you thought, you guessed, would be sought?
- A. It's an assumption. You know -- so I'm
- 14 going to say I don't know.
- Q. And so at this point the research
- department has the correspondence, and they reviewed
- 17 it. What do they pass along to the credit research
- 18 department?
- A. The actual correspondence. And it's
- also noted in the account when they receive it, as
- well, and what they have done in order to conduct
- 22 that research.
- Q. What would they have done at that point?
- A. Well, it depends on the situation. It
- depends on the dispute.

August 28, 2015

16

- Q. So the research passes on the entire
- 2 correspondence that they received?
- A. Right. They can pass that
- correspondence on to that department, as well as
- 5 there is -- well, I'll just say pass on that
- 6 correspondence from the research to that department.
- 7 Q. So once the credit reporting department
- 8 receives this correspondence, they receive the notes
- 9 in the system of what's been done to that point, what
- 10 is their first step?
- A. Their step is based on the dispute they
- will conduct their research to make -- to reaffirm
- that, in this case, that the account belongs to the
- 14 borrower. They will also, as far as notate the
- 15 account, to input -- to show what they've done to
- reaffirm that this account is the borrower's account.
- 17 So they can look into -- review the business records,
- the note, the mortgage, any additional closing docs.
- 19 Q. And so when you say they reaffirm the
- 20 account belongs to the borrower, is that something
- that's done regardless of the dispute?
- A. Yes. That can be done in the research
- department, as well as before forwarding over to the
- 24 credit reporting department. Again, it depends on
- 25 the dispute. So if there is a credit reporting

August 28, 2015

17

- dispute, it would go to the credit reporting
- 2 department.
- Q. And so regardless of what else the
- 4 correspondence disputes, once -- the credit reporting
- 5 department is going to reaffirm that the debt belongs
- 6 to the borrower?
- A. That is correct.
- Q. And are there any other steps that are
- 9 taken in every dispute regardless of what the
- 10 specific content is? Because it sounds like --
- 11 A. Yes. Again, you have to be a little
- more -- you have to generalize based on a dispute or
- be a little more specific on what type of dispute in
- 14 the credit reporting department that they handled.
- Q. But they do reaffirm the debt belongs to
- 16 the borrower?
- A. That is correct.
- 18 Q. Regardless of dispute?
- But beyond that, there is no other
- standard practice in the research department?
- A. Again, it depends on the type of
- 22 dispute. And then the response goes back to the
- 23 borrower based on what they've concluded on their --
- 24 on their research.
- Q. Now, is that -- even if a dispute is

- originated from the credit reporting agency, does the
- 2 borrower still get a direct resolution letter from
- 3 OCWEN?
- A. Can you repeat that question?
- Q. Yes.
- So there are two ways a consumer can
- 7 dispute their debt, either directly or through a
- 8 credit reporting agency?
- A. That is correct. We start with a
- 10 borrower's dispute.
- 11 Q. So if a dispute came through a credit
- 12 reporting agency --
- A. Then it goes directly to the credit
- 14 reporting department. There is a separate system
- 15 that they use that does the communications to the
- 16 national agencies.
- Q. Let me back up then. I'm sorry. I got
- 18 confused.
- So this is when the borrower submits the
- 20 dispute, the --
- A. A direct dispute from the borrower. I
- 22 think that was your initial question.
- Q. Got you.
- And so the response would go directly
- 25 back to the borrower at that point?

August 28, 2015

19

- A. That's correct.
- Q. If a dispute originated from a
- 3 third-party that was authorized to file that dispute,
- would they get the dispute resolved?
- 5 A. All parties should receive it. The
- 6 borrower should receive, as well as the third-party.
- Q. And so -- okay. So when the credit
- 8 reporting agency initially makes the dispute with
- 9 OCWEN, is there a different process? Does it go to
- the research department?
- 11 A. No, because the credit agency went
- directly to the credit reporting department. They
- use a separate system to do their communications
- 14 regarding the dispute.
- Q. What system is that?
- A. e-Oscar.
- 17 Q. So what form comes to the credit
- 18 reporting department through e-Oscar?
- 19 A. e-Oscar is an ACDV.
- Q. Is it always automated or is there ever
- 21 just a regular consumer dispute verification form
- sent, a paper form sent?
- A. No. Everything is through the system.
- Q. Strictly automated?
- 25 A. Yes.

August 28, 2015

20 Q. And does anything come along with the ACDV? 3 A. No. 4 Q. Are there ever any attachments to the 5 ACDV from the credit reporting agencies to OCWEN? 6 A. It's just the type of dispute. And based on the type of dispute, the credit reporting 8 department then notates the OCWEN system of the 9 dispute coming in. And that also takes within 10 30 days to respond back. 11 The 30 days starts as soon as OCWEN 0. 12 receives the ACDV? 13 That is correct. And that stays 14 directly in the credit reporting department. 15 So OCWEN's investigation is based solely off of the credit reporting agency's dispute? 16 17 OCWEN, meaning the credit reporting A. 18 department? 19 Q. Yes. 20 A. Yes. 21 Q. Sorry. 22 So they don't receive correspondence 23 when they get an ACDV --24 A. No.

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

-- is that correct?

202-220-4158

25

August 28, 2015

21

- A. No.
- 2 Q. So, for instance, Equifax would not
- 3 attach a letter from a consumer?
- A. No.
- 5 Q. So how does Equifax communicate the
- 6 dispute for OCWEN to reinvestigate?
- 7 A. Certain codes that they use, and based
- 8 on the code they -- for instance, Equifax stipulates
- 9 what the dispute is about. And that also gets
- 10 notated in OCWEN's system.
- 11 Q. When you say stipulates what the dispute
- 12 is about --
- A. Right. Based on an AC -- ACDV form that
- 14 comes through to OCWEN through the e-Oscar, it tells
- you what the dispute is, borrower's name,
- information, and the type of dispute that the
- borrower has sent to them.
- Q. So based on that -- based on
- 19 Equifax's -- in this example, based on Equifax's
- 20 designation of the dispute, OCWEN investigates that
- 21 specific dispute?
- A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. Along with affirming that the account
- 24 belongs to the borrower?
- 25 A. That is correct.

August 28, 2015

22

- Q. So what are OCWEN's -- what's their
- decision tree once they receive a dispute and they've
- 3 reinvestigated it?
- A. The response goes back to the credit
- 5 agency based on their findings.
- Q. And what are the possible responses?
- 7 A. The possible responses is reconfirming
- 8 that the borrower's name matches to OCWEN's records,
- 9 Social Security number, property address, and
- whatever the findings are as far as the credit that
- OCWEN has reported to the credit agency. And the
- credit reporting also does initial investigation as
- 13 far as reviewing the business records, as well as
- what's in the OCWEN system, to assure that the
- account does belong to the borrower.
- Q. So you say they can review the business
- 17 records?
- 18 A. Yes.
- Q. And you reference the mortgage?
- A. The mortgage, any closing documentation,
- 21 anything that is forwarded to us.
- Q. Forwarded from where?
- A. From the processors, in this case Litton
- Mortgage. So in this case OCWEN acquired Litton
- 25 Mortgage, so OCWEN also had access to their business

August 28, 2015

23

- records, as well, their system, reconfirming that.
- Q. Okay. In a hypothetical where OCWEN
- 3 received a dispute, they look over the closing
- documents and they're still not able to resolve the
- dispute by looking at those, other paperwork, is
- 6 there anything else they can do to investigate such a
- 7 dispute?
- A. Well, hypothetical question?
- 9 Q. Yes.
- A. Hypothetical.
- 11 Q. Can they, for instance, contact the
- research department for a service question?
- A. They have access to contact any
- 14 department within OCWEN, as well as they can
- 15 research -- they're trained to research anything --
- anything as far as the whole system, so the whole
- system is the loan servicing system. They can find
- any additional information or any information that
- 19 they can possibly find in the OCWEN system.
- Q. So they do have broader access -- they
- 21 typically would look to closing documents or
- documents from the prior servicer, but if they needed
- 23 additional information they have access to that?
- A. Yes. The system -- I have access. I
- 25 can view each -- I can view as far as escrows, loan

- information, taxes, anything dealing with the loan
- 2 servicing of that loan.
- And just to clarify, each department
- 4 have certain -- have their own functions as far as
- 5 system -- well, like credit reporting deals strictly
- with credit reporting. They're not accessed to input
- other information other than the credit reporting
- information. Same goes for any other department.
- 9 Q. So someone in credit reporting could
- 10 review an escrow department?
- A. They can only review it.
- Q. But they can't add to it?
- A. They can't add to it.
- Q. Okay. Is there ever a situation where
- credit reporting identifies an issue in the escrow
- department and they need to communicate to escrow to
- 17 fix it or to collaborate? Does that occur?
- 18 A. It could occur with any department, so
- an email and/or -- as well as identifying in the note
- log an email sent to; for instance, you mentioned
- 21 escrow department, identifying an error.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Or a correction in -- error, a
- correction that needs to be made.
- Q. So if the credit reporting department

- identifies an issue that has arisen in another
- department, are they able to change the credit report
- without modifying the other department, as well?
- A. Who?
- 5 Q. So, for instance, the credit reporting
- 6 department identifies an issue with escrow based on a
- 7 consumer dispute, they notify the escrow department.
- 8 Are they allowed to modify the credit report based on
- 9 this dispute and their investigation without getting
- a simultaneous modification in the escrow department?
- MR. MANNING: Object to the form.
- You can answer if you understand.
- THE WITNESS: I think I understand. I
- 14 think.
- 15 BY MR. NOLAN:
- Q. Convoluted there, so --
- A. Based on your question, nothing can be
- done to -- in regards to credit reporting until the
- 19 full investigation is completed, if that's what you
- 20 meant. And these are all hypothetical questions.
- Q. That is correct.
- A. Okay.
- Q. So once the credit reporting department
- 24 completes its review and sends a response back to the
- 25 credit reporting agency, I assume?